The Role of Church in the Mist of Modernity and Morality: Baron Fredrick von Hügel’s Formula for Church and Examining the Foundation of Moral Law

Kelsey McDougall Yuhas

Carroll College, Helena, MT
Signature Page

This thesis for honors recognition has been approved
for the Department of Theology.

Director:  
Dr. John C. Ries  8 April 2011

Reader:  
Dr. Chris Fuller  8 April 2011
The Role of Church in the Mist of Modernity and Morality:
Baron Fredrick von Hügel’s Formula for Church and
Examining the Foundation of Moral Law

Kelsey E. McDougall Yuhas

Theology/Honors Scholars Thesis
Carroll College
April 10, 2011
The Role of Church in the Mist of Modernity and Morality:
Baron Fredrick von Hügel’s Formula for Church and
Examining the Foundation of Moral Law

The age of modernity was a time of great conflict in the world of theology. In panic Pope Pius X issued three major documents banning all modern practices of interpretation that were applied to theological studies. George Tyrell however believed there could be a harmonious relationship between modern methodologies and traditional thought of systematic interpretations. Baron Friedrick von Hügel provided three elements of church that are essential for such a community to fulfill the needs of its people in the relationship between man and the divine: institutional, intellectual, and devotional. This enables the church to fulfill its mission: to unite God and creation. Examining the Eternal, the Natural, the Divine, and Revealed laws provides a foundation for Hügel’s elements. With the guidance of the elements and the understanding of moral law, church is accomplished.
Introduction

Baron Friedrich von Hügel and the age of modernity came out of a period of suppression of modern thought. The traditions and customs of the Catholic Church had not changed since the Council of Trent of 1545. It was a response to the Protestant Reformation. Almost a half a millennium later, the church had fallen out of communication with its people. Truths held within the realm of Christianity became disconnected from the truths of the modern world. Hügel felt a need to once again define church and reestablish a connection with the current issues and thoughts of the present era.

The Age of Modernity

Modernity by its pure definition is an age, idea, practice or concept in its particular time period. The age of modernity that I will be referring to is the period of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century, the time period during the office of Pope Pius X. During Pius' time, a revival of ancient philosophy was entering back into the processes of theology. Science was another addition. A new order of philosophical and theological systems hit the ecclesiastical world that challenged the old ways of interpretation.

Those who used these exercises were called modernists. A modernist is defined as “a person who advocates the study of modern subjects in preference
to new sources as well as ancient classics.”¹ George Tyrrell wrote, “By a modernist, I mean a churchman of any sort, who believes in the possibility of a synthesis between the essential truth of his religion and the essential truth of modernity.”²

Outside interpreters, such as scientists, historians, and alternative thinkers began to interpret the church's teachings and laws. Pope Pius X attempted to stifle the modernity movement and its advocates that had swept the Catholic Church. From 1907 to 1910 Pius condemned modernity through three documents, *Lamentabili* to label modernity as “a system of all heresies, *Pascendi* to ban modernity as a philosophical and theological system, and lastly *Sacrorum Antistitum* an oath for all clergy to renew each year. To understand the severity of Pius' wishes, the oath follows. “I firmly embrace and accept anything and everything defined, asserted, and declared by the inerrant magisterium of the church, especially those articles of doctrine that are directly opposed to the errors of the present time.”³ Hügel along with other modernists attempted to make the Catholic Church and the current society unified. Interestingly enough he was not excommunicated. But several of his colleagues, Alfred Loisy and George Tyrrell, were.

**Purpose of a Modernist**

David Tracy notes well Hügel's intended mission. Tracy calls the modernist a “revisionist theologian.” Paralleled with Hügel’s theology, he

---

states the need for reconciliation of basic principles between faith and modernity.

“The revisionist theologian is committed to what seem clearly to be the central talks of contemporary Christian theology: the dramatic confrontation, the mutual illuminations and corrections, the possible basic reconciliation between the principal values, cognitive claims, and existential faiths of both a reinterpreted post-modern consciousness and a reinterpreted Christianity.”

There was a need for the Catholic Church to reunite itself with the people. It had become an institution outside its time and context. It was a place of ultimate determinism and was unable to theologically analyze its teachings and practices and apply them to the modern world.

However, in this Age of Modernity, modernism was difficult to accomplish. Pope Paul X suppressed modernism within the church in fear that its outside ideas and influences would destroy the purity of God’s divine church on Earth. However, Hügel holds a different view. In fact, the idea of modernity itself was intertwined within the very meaning of church. Church, as a form of God’s presence in the world, is also integrated within humanity. It is essential for creation to have an active part in the growth towards Christ.

The Church “is where God (in the world) meets Christ (in the Christian

---

4 He also notes that “neo-orthodoxy is best understood as a self-critical moment in the history of liberalism… [in the opinion of B.M. G. Reardon] various orthodox theologies are properly understood not as the mere self-expression of a faith community, but rather as self-expressions deeply influenced by the orthodox reactions to the challenge of liberalism.” Tracy, David. *Blessed Rage for Order*, (Minneapolis: Seabury Press, 1975), 34.
community).” Only with both the divine and physical elements can church be present. Just as God seeks unity with humanity, church holds a physical representation of God’s connection and dwelling with humanity.

Because of its oneness with humanity the church is called to hold a dynamic quality so that it may respond to the character of creation. As time goes on, human society changes and church, in order to remain a connection between God and man, must adjust its means of communication. The Catholic Church seeks this through practice, contemplation, and faith.

The Church According to Baron Friedrich von Hügel

Hügel's recipe for church has been noted by multiple theologians such as David Tracy and Karl Rahner of the twentieth century. Through this formula Hügel reflects on the necessary elements of church. It intertwines with human experience, interpretation, and participation. In three categories, the formula organizes and clarifies the necessities of society, and individuals to live a full Christian life.

Three Elements of Church

Three categorical elements are necessary in order for a church to function; the Institutional, the Intellectual, and the Devotional. These aspects of the church are necessary to enable the reality of God to unite with creation. This is constructed on the base of interpreted historical experience. Institution includes the structure of the church such as papacy, clergy, and cannon.

intellectual includes the theologians, historians, educators, and philosophers: the thought, contemplation, and interpretation. And the devotional (or mystical) contains sacraments, scripture reading, and prayer, the daily participation in Christian life.  

In Timothy G. McCarthy’s book *The Catholic Tradition: The Church in the Twentieth Century* he comments on Hügel’s elements. The institutional, intellectual and devotional aspects of church are “indispensable, complimentary, and distinct contributions.” While providing their own distinct qualities, they contribute to one another. With these intertwining qualities there are also conflicts. These conflicts are checks and balances. Never can one element run church on its own.

If one piece of the formula is used there is a risk of going to the extremes. If institution was alone it would neglect absorbing the new experiences building upon past experiences. There would be no foundation built and each and every experience would be interpreted in a way that would cause them to be of their own, holding no ultimate value. Isolated experiences and interpretations would also be intertwined with a less than dynamic devotional practice. No unity between individuals who participate would be created. Therefore, church would not be accomplished.

---

7 Ibid 1.
The Elements of the Church

Institutional

Institution contains the structure of the church. This includes the laws and papal hierarchy. Its purpose is order, providing a structure of government, and rite. Church law is based on collected experiences and interpretations. Its discipline provides institutional and individual regulations.\(^8\)

An example within the element of institution is the written laws such as the Canon of the Catholic Church. There are two types of Canon Law: the Natural and the Ecclesiastical laws. Natural law is God's sanctioned laws for all of humanity. Ecclesiastical law involves the laws of the ecclesiastical work of a local area. These laws can be sanctioned for particular parts of the world, to fit the needs of the people according to their location, culture, tradition, and history.

Intellectual

Intellectual is the second element in Baron Friedrich von Hügel’s formula for church. The intellectual includes belief. This term should be clarified and separately defined from faith. Belief is an explanation or interpretation of the faith. Beliefs are derived from historians, theologians, \(^8\)

---

philosophers, and teachers. They are “intellectual explanations” of a faith.\(^9\) Explanations of the faith may include history, science, and philosophy.

In recognizing all these tools, the element of the intellectual is essential in coming to know God.\(^10\) It continually evaluates and critically thinks about the doctrines, faiths, scriptures, traditions, and adds on new elements of interpretation furthering clarification and completeness to the foundations of the faith. Without it, no tradition or doctrine would be created.

**Devotional**

Faith falls under this element of church “Christian spirituality is built on faith […] there are] three traditional components of faith: conviction, commitment, and confidence (trust).”\(^11\) These components define the action of a Christian’s life. To understand faith in a broader sense, the following quote defines the word as a foundation for all things to follow.

“While each religion has different beliefs and practices that are culturally fashioned and historically circumscribed, common to all religions is faith. Faith—a commitment supported by conviction and confidence—is the most basic and dynamic feature of each religion…communities of faith.”\(^12\) The Catholic Church’s Catechism is the written expression of tradition derived from learned faith. “This catechism is conceived as *an organic presentation* of

---


the Catholic faith in its entirety.”¹³ Tradition, or a way of life is recorded by catechists, its definition is as follows. “Catechesis is an education in the faith […] of the people]… in an organic and systematic way, with a view to initiating the hearers into the fullness of Christian life”.¹⁴ Its origins are “inspired” by four pillars, “the baptismal profession of faith (the Creed), “the sacraments of the faith,” “the life of the faith (the Commandments),” and “the prayer of the believer” (the Lord’s Prayer).

Scripture is also an essential part to the devotion. Recognized as the Divine Word of God, it is encouraged to refer to the scriptures daily.¹⁵ They are not often quoted word for word in the Catechism. Scriptures should be read themselves for deeper understanding. “Such Biblical references are a valuable working-tool in Catechists.”¹⁶ It contains interpretations and explanations for the scripture, the faith, and documents of the Catholic Church.

In conversation, a dear mentor commented on the building of faith. “If you read the catechism as a devotional then it is very prayerful and intellectual in the matters of prayer and study.” John Paul II writes to the people published in the beginning of the Catechism (1997).

“The principle task entrusted to the Council by Pope John XXIII was to guard and present better the precious deposit of Christian doctrine in order to make it more accessible to...all the people of good will...Our

¹⁴ Ibid Prologue II.5.
¹⁶ Ibid Prologue V. 19.
duty is to dedicate ourselves with an earnest will and without fear to that work which our era demands of us, thus perusing the path which the Church has followed for 20 centuries.” 17

It is a piece to the fulfillment of the mission of the Catholic Church.

“Still, the Christian faith is not a “religion of the book” The attention of the faithful cannot remain solely amongst the scriptures. To bring the scriptures into hearts and make them incarnate in God’s world there must be further action. They are to “grow” in those who read them.18 Christianity is the religion of the “Word” of God, a word which is “not a written and mute word, but the Word which is incarnate and living.” If the Scriptures are not to remain a dead letter, Christ, the eternal Word of the living God, must, through the Holy Spirit, “open [our] mind to understand the Scriptures.”19 It has inspired the faithful to write the sacred books.

Tradition is the best indication in how belief is developed. It is through devotion. Its origins are past from one generation to the next and an ever living experience of the present. The people in all cultures hold traditions that contain history and meaning in their lives. As a human reality the scriptures become integrated within everyday life. The human reality therefore is a part of the church and its origin, God.

In this religious sense, tradition is developed from the previous disciples of God. The sacred scripture faith and tradition is faith transformed.

---

19 Ibid 3. II. 108.
“Sacred Tradition and Sacred Scripture, then, are bound closely together and communicated one with the other. For both of them, flowing out from the same divine well-spring, come together in some fashion to form one thing and move towards the same goal.”

It is faith transformed into belief. In turn institution is created. All elements of the formula fulfill the other's potential.

**Definitions and Dynamics of the Moral Law**

Hügel not only felt that the Church needed to unite God with humanity, but it was the very moral obligation of the church to do so, its mission. The church in some way was required to look at modern thought and issues and make an effort interpret to approach a form of growth and understanding further gaining unity with the present era. The outline of moral theology provides a definition and guide of mission for church to be accomplished.

**The Divine, Natural, and Positive Laws**

In a Christian perspective there are four kinds of laws for humanity and its evolution: Divine or Eternal Law, Natural Law, Positive Law, and Revealed Law. Eternal Law is the root of all other laws originating within the mind of

---

20 Ibid 2. II. 80.
God. This law is beyond the grasp of human understanding. Natural Law, with its universal quality, stems from this. Natural Law is the tangible and yet not fully understood law to be carried out amongst humanity. Natural Law, as previously defined as the law that addresses and enables fulfillment of humanity, is carried out by the Human Law, also known as Positive law, the concrete means of which humanity carries out the Natural Laws.

Humanity is an ever evolving community. As time advances, the interactions, personalities, ideas and beliefs in society change. Not one point in history is the society of humanity the same as another. Yet humanity, as a whole is unified. It shares common basic needs to survive: spiritual and bodily. Certain laws or rules must be applied to create a harmonious environment enabling humanity to be fulfilled. This is the Natural Law. And it applies to all of humanity as a whole. With an ever growing and changing society there is also a need for evolution of this law. Not necessarily a change of the law but a better understanding or tangible means to carry out the law so that humanity does not become disconnected with its basic principles as society advances.

In brief, the Positive laws must be in accordance to a society’s particular needs. The tangible means of which this law is carried out may vary from society to society. So Positive Laws allow for the Natural Law (or universal needs) to be carried out to it’s full potential.

**Revealed Law**

But as we have noted above, society changes just as time advances. What may be considered the social norm or need at one particular time period may be
different in another one. So how is Natural Law and its Positive Laws addressed? They are continually developed by Revealed Law. Revealed Laws inspire man by the Holy Spirit through revelation building upon the previous revealed truth deepening the understanding of the law. “Distinct from the knowledge of God's will [it is] attainable by human reason alone.”24 This calls for the everlasting God to communicate with his people throughout time with his Divine or Eternal Law so that they do not lack or become disconnected from the Natural Laws. Advancement without revelation can obscure the truth, lead humanity down wrong paths, and manipulate the truth into evil means.25 The means by which humanity’s needs are met change through history, therefore so do the laws of man’s society. Further knowledge in a particular era is necessary so that humanity is not disconnected from the Natural Law. Without the aid of God and his revelations for man, Natural Law would no longer be recognized, lost, and unfulfilled.

The Debate on Revealed Laws

Pope Leo XIII writes about these laws to guide the Christian. His encyclical on, The Right Ordering of Christian Life, is a response to the controversy over modern thought at the end of the nineteenth century. Modernist theologians such as Hügel, George Tyrell, and Alfred Loisy participated in the

25 Ibid 1.
drive of this movement towards Rome. However, clerical authority was considered the first and only credible source in interpreting the word. The modernist theologian felt that the ability of God’s laws to be further understood was stifled when other sources of interpretation and revelation were cast out.

Hügel, along with his colleagues, challenged the church stating there were other sources through which the Spirit was working within the Church, namely, the laity: further the theologians, scientists and historians. Hügel comments: “Faith, ever growing by development of doctrine, and the apprehensions of Reason, ever growing by the accumulation of its materials and the perfecting of its methods [are]… the very necessities and obligations of the Catholic position.” Continuing further down the page, 26 “[therefore] we cannot then well think of Revelation without Inspiration.” 27

Here was Pope Leo’s response.

The Right Ordering of Christian Life…

The world has fallen into an abyss of corrupt desires and practices. Where is the order for the world? Pope Leo looks at the world as nothing but devastating corruption. However, in the mist of this chaos, he points to the church as the sign of hope for the people. “Men looked with confidence to the Apostolic See.” 28 The church is essential to the lives of the people. Its mission, to see “that the counsels

27 Ibid 51.
of God may be both understood and put into practice.” The very mission of the church is to incorporate hope and bring life back into the world. Specifically, it is a moral obligation to unite every human soul with Christ. Hügel agrees. However, further argues that the mind is at a loss because many in our world seek the truth “by the aid of reason alone.” This rejection of interpretation outside of the church advances with Leo’s successor Pope Pius X and his three documents.

An obstacle that we have in us is our original sin. The “tortuous roots of sin” are “without reason”. Pope Leo recalls original sin and that it has damaged humanity’s strength to ward off temptation. Further, when the mind has chosen to use reason alone it follows the patterns of the world and in turn becomes poisoned by its ways and its habits. Thus, “the moral character becomes deeply and essentially corrupted.” The source of strength to overcome these temptations is from Jesus Christ. And who holds this grace here on Earth? It is the church. The church is God’s provided aid so many reject and avoid falling into the ways of the world. And it is the duty of Christians to follow their mother. If a person so chooses to turn to their own direction in rejection of the Church they obtain “free-thought and evil example.”

30 Ibid Sec 6
31 Cross reference of “Lamentabili, Pascendi, and Sacrorum Antistitum” Pg 2
33 Ibid Sec 7.
34 Ibid Sec 9
35 Ibid Sec 11
“Man’s power by itself is not equal to the responsibility of so many duties.”36 So what is man’s ultimate duty to himself and to humanity? It is to pray. “Lead us not into temptation” is the greatest prayer one can make in virtue in leading humanity to Christ. It holds steadfast against all possible corruption which in turn makes available the will of God to take place.37 With persistence in prayer the greatest of virtues, according to Leo, virtue and justice is practiced.38 And those who devote their lives to prayer, and even further, to the church possess the greatest amount of grace anyone could obtain to ward off sin. They set themselves apart from the world. As Leo asks, “How much more faithful and steadfast ought priests to be?”39 The soul must be separate from all worldly desires, open to the heart of the church, Christ, before it can be concerned with the suffering of humanity and their souls. By moral obligation it is the duty of the apostolic succession to safe guard and filter out all those who oppose ecclesiastical instruction and direction.

*Instructions to Catechumens*

For clarity in interpreting God, St. John Chrysostom calls Christians to full conversion in his writing, *Instructions to Catechumens*. Such a conversion requires a renewing of heart, mind, and soul. One must protect himself and turn away all things foreign to God. This is a call for faithfulness of humanity. Like Pope Leo he speaks of the unclean and corrupted world and what it does to the soul. “Just as to touch dead bodies is not naturally unclean, but when this comes

---

36 Ibid Sec 11  
37 Ibid Sec 12  
38 Ibid Sec 14  
39 Ibid Sec 14
into contact with a weak conscience.”

Conscience, the core influence on human action needs to strengthen itself so that it can discern correctly between what is holy and what is evil. To do this the heart needs to turn to Christ. When one separates himself from the world and bonds with the Holy Spirit it leaves the heart open to renewal and clarity.

But in a deeper sense Chrysostom calls for a deeper conversion of the human spirit. He notes Paul in 1 Corinthians 12:8-9. “For to one is given through the Spirit the world of wisdom; to another the word of knowledge according to the same Spirit. The Holy Spirit is in the lace as a vein feeding all parts of the body wit the same blood.” The parts, which are each its own in task and place, are supplied by this same blood. “Do you see how he everywhere makes this addition, saying, through the same Spirit, and according to the same Spirit? For he knew that the comfort from thence was great.” 41 Each part with its own task lifts the burden off the other parts. Because of this, there is balance in the body.

**Conclusion**

Baron Friedrich von Hügel’s three elements of church, the institutional, the devotional, and the intellectual provide a definition of church. Institutional contains the instructions and guidelines for community. Intellectual provides critical thinking and interpretation. Devotional includes the individual and his participation. These three elements possess in their own nature, a dynamic

---

40 Ibid Sec 2.
41 Ibid Sec 5.
principle. It allows a concrete object, the church, to be an institution of transformation.

The dynamic principles of modernity takes current events adds them to past experiences and interpretations. Including modernism into its practices of interpretation, the Church better equips itself with tools needed to relate to society. The church becomes itself, the unity between God and man.

Both St. John Chrysostom, and Pope Leo XIII agreed to the statement “nothing is equal to the Church.” 42 She is the way to unity with Christ and for reliable revelation and interpretation. Pope Leo felt the church and apostolic succession was the only credible source. All exploration and study should be done under the guidance and authority of the church. However, the power of the Holy Spirit amongst the masses and the diversity of the gifts are much more prevalent to Chrysostom. Hügel felt it was the obligation of the clergy to open themselves up further to more diverse resources feeding knowledge and wisdom to the church.

“Creation is the foundation of “all God's saving plans: the beginning of history of salvation: that culminates Christ.”43

The Church is a living reality of creation and the practice of modernity is essential for acquiring the goal of creation, to know and to become one with God.

McDougall 20

Works Cited


